Concept Paper on Ubudehe Categorisation

1. Context

This concept note serves as a tool to share the principles that inform the design of the Ubudehe categorisation effort that is ongoing in Rwanda since 2001. The reason for this is that Ubudehe database was designed for ubudehe programme, but currently different institutions are using the data (eg MoH, Mineduc, VUP, etc). Following use of Ubudehe data for targeting of beneficiaries by different government programmes coupled with extensive awareness creation on the how the government programmes use the data to get their respective beneficiaries, community members are responding by falling into lower echelon categories (Ubudehe 1, 2, 3) so that they access government services at no cost. The different programmes using Ubudehe data may serve different purposes and have different monetary costs.

This implies that Ubudehe data per se' is insufficient to determine eligibility of beneficiaries to different programmes. It should be used as a basis for developing appropriate targeting mechanisms that are suitable to specific program objectives depending on their cost and political implications. Otherwise the ubudehe database compromise is compromised by targeting needs of different programs.

To further develop the ubudehe database and to ensure appropriate use, mechanisms should be developed to upgrade the database and control what it is being used for.

To achieve this, some questions need to be answered:

i.   How can ubudehe database be improved to serve social protection programmes?

ii. How can social protection programs and other complementary programmes use the same database with the same baseline?

iii. When and how to update the database?

iv. How to use ubudehe data? etc.

Ubudehe categories review

After a consultation process at different levels, ubudehe categories have been reviewed from 6 existing categories to 4 Ubudehe categories. This exercise was to solve the stigma caused by some of the six categories, and revise some of the characteristics to match the current socio-economic context of the population. The revised categories are presented as follow:

I. **Revised ubudehe categories**

Category	Criteria	Remarks and Examples
1	a) Household with no House / Kuba nta nzu bafite, Household without ability to rent a house/ Kuba nta bushobozi bwo gukodesha inzu b) Household that very often struggles to get food/Babona ibyo kurya mu buryo bugoye c) Household that struggles to get household basic items such as soap, paraffin, salt, clothes /Babona ibikoresho by'ibanze byo mu rugo nk'isabune, peteroli, umunyu, imyambaro mu buryo bugoye	Very often struggles to get food: Able to eat at most once a day/Babona ibyo kurya mu buryo bugoye: Akenshi bashobora kurya ni rimwe ku munsi
2	a) Owns a house/kuba bafite inzu yabo yo kubamo; b) Able to rent a house/Bafite ubushobozi bwo gukodesha inzu yo kubamo c) Often gets food/Igihe kinini babona	Often gets food: Able to eat at least twice a day/ Igihe kinini babona ibyo

		ibyo kurya	kurya /Hari ubushobozi bwo kurya nibura kabiri ku munsi
	d)	Often works for others (wages)/Ahanini bakorera abandi	
	e)	Employees with non permanent jobs /Abakozi babona akazi rimwe na rimwe(nyakabyizi)	
3	a)	The head of the household or his spouse is an employee in Public or Private Sector/Umukuru w'urugo cyangwa uwo bashakanye akorera Leta cyangwa Abikorera	For HH in this category who may be having varying levels of welfare (eg, not all public Servants have same income), they are further separated by their businesses and their level of asset accumulation/
	b)	The head of the household or his spouse is self employed with business/ Umukuru w'urugo cyangwa uwo bashakanye wikoresha	
	c)	Farmers with surplus for market/Abahinzi-borozi basagurira isoko	Kuri iki cyiciro imibereho y'abagize ingo iratandukanye (urugero ntabwo abakozi ba Leta bose banganya umushahara n'indi myinjirize y'umutungo), barongera bagatandukanywa n'uburyo babyaza umusaruro n'umutongo bamaze kugira, bishobora kwimurira bamwe mu cyiciro cya 04
	d)	The head of the household or his spouse who is a small trader/ Umukuru w'urugo cyangwa uwo bashakanye, uri mu bucuruzi buciriritse harimo n'abadandaza	
			NB: The targeted member of household is the head of household or his spouse; /Ureberwaho ubushobozi ni umukuru w'urugo cyangwa uwo

			bashakanye.
4	a)	With a big trader (whole sales, may be producing locally, or in import and export trade)/Bafite umuntu uri mubucuruzi buhambaye(Uranguza, yaba akorera mugihugu cyangwa hanaze yacyo, cyangwa uri mu bucuruzi bwambukiranya imipaka y'igihugu	Some farmers, traders and employees in Public and Private sector might find way into this category, as a result of their investment levels/Asset acquisition levels/Birashoboka ko hari abahinzi-borozi, abacuruzi , abakozi ba Leta n'abakozi bakorera abikorera bajya muri iki cyiciro biturutse ku mutungo bamaze kugeraho.
	b)	The head of household or his spouse who owns a company providing specialized services (transport, consultancy, etc)/Umukuru w'urugo, cyangwa uwo bashakanye, ufite I Sosiyete itanga serivise zihariye nko gutwara abantu n'ibintu, Konsiritanse	
	c)	The head of household or his spouse who is an employee in Public or Private Sector at high leadership level/Umukuru w'urugo cyangwa uwo bashakanye, ukorera Leta cyangwa Abikorera uri ku rwego rwo hejuru rw'ubuyobozi	**NB:** The targeted member of household is the head of household or his spouse; /Ureberwaho ubushobozi ni umukuru w'urugo cyangwa uwo bwashakanye.
	d)	The head of household or his spouse who has (an) industry(ies)/ Umukuru w'urugo cyangwa uwo bashakanye afite uruganda.	
	e)	The head of household or his spouse who has rented house (s) in big cities or other big businesses (tracks, petrol stations, etc) / Umukuru w'urugo cyangwa uwo bashakanye ufite inyubako z'ubucuruzi mu mijyi minini cyangwa ubundi bucuruzi bwagutse (amakamyo manini, sitasiyo za lisansi, etc)	

II. Methodological Approach and Process

Ubudehe database contains data collected at village level, for each and every household, for household head and household members. It is based on the principles of community participation through data collection and validation by community members themselves. Data are collected and validated at village level then submitted to the respective top levels up to districts, for validation and comparison with other existing socio-economic data. Finally they are validated at province level and consolidated at national level.

a) Ubudehe data collection

After intensive mobilization and awareness campaign, the exercise will be carried out by the team formed by Village Coordinator and Chairperson of Ubudehe committee as facilitators and one enumerator (with good hand writing). After validation of gathered information at village level, all forms will be assembled at respective cell office for cross-checking and validation. The cell will produce the summary of data at cell level and then submit the set of data with all the household forms to the sector for data entry exercise.

b) Data entry

With hypothesis of 40 forms by each data entry clerk per day, the number of data entry clerks will vary from 20 to 5 per sector depending on the number of households identified within a sector. With this perspective, the process will take about 31 working days (around 2 months calendar).

The sector will validate the data and compare them with the other existing socio-economic data such as EICV3 and others. Once the data are validated at sector level, the sector will officially submit data to the district level for validation, comparison with other existing socio-economic data.

The District will manage and coordinate the data entry process preferably at Sector level to facilitate the process of cross-checking the provided data. The

alternative can be proceeding with data entry process at District level where the supervision and data entry cleaning process, data consolidation can be easily managed.

c) Data analysis

There is need to hire an expert to coordinate the team in charge of data analysis which will be compiling all the files collected from different data entry sites and will be performing tasks of data cleaning in collaboration with the District Statistician, LODA statistician and IT staff. Also the expert will provide the data analysis report.

d) Categorisation

The process of categorisation will be carried out according to ubudehe revised categories and criteria/characteristics; in combination with the household data provided in community meeting. Household profile according to ubudehe criteria will determine the final household category.

f) Data verification at Sector

After data entry, sector committee will sit to crosscheck and see the consistency and quality of the data, comparing with other existing socio-economic data.

The verification team will be composed of sector staff, chaired by the executive secretary of the sector and key stakeholders (Police, Army, NSS, JADF); and the executive committee of sector council. Then the data are submitted to district for validation and comparison with other existing socio-economic data.

f) At district level

The data will be validated by the district executive committee. Thereafter, the lists will be sent back to villages to enable all citizens to verify if the information they provided were well recorded by enumerators. In case of misreporting, the citizen appeals immediately to the executive secretary of the cell. After

verification by citizens, the lists are re-sent together with approved appeals (and appeals report) to the sector.

g) Appeals and complaints

Guided Appeals Process: Community members are allowed to appeal for any decision or data provided considered as being wrong. Appeal process starts from the community. The second level for appeal is at sector level where the committee to appeal to is formed by Executive secretary (chairperson), the officer i/c of social affairs at sector, cell executive secretaries and the executive committee of sector council. The highest level to appeal to is the district where the district executive committee is the highest decision maker on the appeals. The appeals process will engage oversight structures and resultant information will be validated and reported on.

The Sector committee, in the process of solving the appeals may eventually need to proceed to physical verification into a given household to enable them to take adequate resolutions for appellants.

III. Supervision Structure
1. National Level
- LODA
- MINALOC
- FARG
- NIDA
- RGB
- RDRC
- NCPD
- ITORERO
- MINISANTE
- MINEDUC

- MINECOFIN
- NISR
- RSSB
- NSS
- EWSA
- Police, Army, Reserve force,
- CIVIL SOCIETY

MINALOC will chair the team

2. Province/City of Kigali

- Executive Secretary
- Director of programs
- Director of planning
- NSS
- Police, Army, Reserve force,
- CIVIL SOCIETY

Executive Secretary will chair the team

3. District

- Mayor
- Vice Mayor/ASSOC
- In charge of social protection/Ubudehe Focal point person
- District statistician
- JADF
- NSS
- Police, Army, NSS, Reserve force, DASO,
- CIVIL SOCIETY

Mayor will chair the team

4. Sector

- ES of Sector
- AF Soc/ Sector
- ES of Cells
- JADF
- Police, Army, Reserve force, DASSO

ES/Sector will chair the team

IV. PILOT TESTING, PREPARATORY MEETINGS AND TRAININGS

a) Pilot testing

After cabinet approval for ubudehe revised categories, before rolling out the exercise across the country; there will be a pilot testing exercise on a sample basis. This is to foresee some key possible errors and challenges to be mitigated.

b) Preparatory Meetings

At national level, one day workshop will be organized in Kigali; to present the proposal for the ubudehe categorization 2014 process and data collection exercise. The following will be invited to the meeting:

- Different stakeholders
- Social sector ministries
- Governors & Mayor of Kigali City
- Mayors
- Police, Army, NSS, Inkeragutabara,

c) Training

At Province level: Training of Trainers

Province	Number of people to be trained
Southern	137
Northern	119

Western	131
Eastern	131
Kigali City	107

N.B. The training will be for 2 days because the number of trainees at province level will be divided into 2 groups/classes.

At cell

The trained team (during ToT) from sector level will carry out the training of 3 people per village: village coordinator, chairperson of Ubudehe committee as facilitators (village coordinator, and executive secretary of Cell and the chairperson for Ubudehe committee).

V. Roadmap

The roadmap for Ubudehe categorisation stretches from June 2014 to June 2015, approximately a period of 12 months. The existing ubudehe database was compiled in a period of well over two years. It is hoped that with the well built structures and the planned trainings and sensitisation campaign, the period of 12 months will be sufficient. The roadmap is influenced by:

➢ **The need to sensitise community members** on the revised categories, the processes as well as to stimulate their moral values against distortion of the process in cramble for free benefits. Mindset change is very crucial! The slight modification in the categories and categorisation process justifies the need for extensive sensitisation. There will be need to erase fears for community members that Ubudehe categories are not meant to deprive them of government services such as education and Mituelle de santé.

➢ **The categorisation process**: all community members will be measured by same criteria, as opposed to the former elimination method on category by category. Data collection will be carried out at village level, validation of data, data checking and data entry at sector level. Data will be sent back to the village for validation and consequently running an appeals and complaints process. This may call for verifications at homestead level for some cases

➢ **Guided Appeals Process:** Community members are allowed to appeal for any decision or data provided considered as being wrong. Appeal process starts from the community. The second level for appeal is at sector level where the committee to appeal to is formed by Executive secretary (chairperson), the officer i/c of social affairs at sector, cell executive secretaries and the executive committee of sector council. The highest level to appeal to is the district where the district executive committee is the highest decision maker on the appeals. The appeals process will engage oversight structures and resultant information will be validated and reported on.

➢ **Trainings and sensitivity raising:** Introduction of formal structures into the scene calls for the need for trainings and stimulating sensitivity of the respective structures on the impact of Ubudehe data on national resource allocation and spending, as well as political implications on service delivery. Trainings have to be invested in, in terms of money and time. There are also technical trainings on data collection tools, data entry and analysis.

➢ **The need to understand all government policies** where Ubudehe data will be used for targeting so that their targeting needs are well factored into the Ubudehe categories guidelines.

All these take some time; and the following is the actual roadmap:

ROADMAP FOR UBUDEHE CATEGORISATION 2014-2015

Activity	Sub- Activities	Target Group	Timeline	Responsible
Awareness campaign	Meeting with DGs	LODA, NISR, MINALOC, MINECOFIN	03/07/2014	LODA
	Senior management meeting	MINALOC	07/07/2014	MINALOC
	Meeting at National Level (video conference) and Press Conference	LODA, MINALOC, Governors/Mayor City of Kigali, Districts Mayors, FARG, NISR, NIDA, RGB, REB, RSSB, NPCD, RDRC, RNRA, EWSA, Police, Ingabo, Inkeragutabara, NSS, Civil Society, RURA, Transparency Rwanda, AJPRODO, and Sectors	16/07/2014	LODA, MINALOC
	Meeting at National Level (Technical Level)	LODA, MINALOC, MINISANTE FARG, NISR, NIDA, RGB, REB, RSSB, NPCD, RDRC, RNRA, RURA, EWSA and Itorero	17/07/2014	
	Meeting at cell level	Village coordinators and the chairpersons of Ubudehe committees, one numerator (with good hand writing) and two Opinion leaders	22/07/2014	Sector/Cell
	Meeting at village level	Population at Village/Umuganda	26/07/2014	Sector/Cell
	Panel show/Kubaza bitera kumenya	Population/National TV and Radio	27/07/2014	LODA/MINALOC
Pilot phase (In 2 or 5 DistrictS)	Training of trainers at District level	In charge of social protection/ Ubudehe focal point person, District statistician, police, Army, NSS, Reserve force, an Opinion leader representing each sector, civil society, a JADF, representative of district council, Ubudehe sector focal point person / a professional for social protection, ES of sector, DASSO, VUP Coordinator	04-05/08/2014	LODA/2 Districts
	Training of trainers at Sector level	ES and SEDO of cell, police, Army, Reserve force, an Opinion leader representing each sector, civil	07-08/08/2014	ES of sector

		society, JADF, representative of njyanama, Ubudehe focal point person / a professional for social protection, DASSO, VUP Staff		
	Training of facilitators + enumerator at cell level	Village coordinators and the chairpersons of Ubudehe committees, one enumerator with good hand writing	09-10/08/2014	ES of Cell
	Printing of forms	Forms for 2/5 Districts	28/07-10/08/2014	LODA
	Recruitment of Data clerks	Data clerks	28/07-10/08/2014	2/5 Districts
	Training of data clerks	Data entry clerks	28/07-10/08/2014	LODA & 2/5 Districts
	Data collection	Population	11/08/-25/08/2014	LODA, MINALOC, LG
	Data entry	Data clerks	27/08/-20/09/2014	LODA, MINALOC, LG
	Printing and publication of data for 2 or 5 districts	Data results (2 or 5 districts)	22-25/09/2014	LG (2 or 5 Districts) + LODA
	Appeals and complaints	Population	26-30/09/2014	LG (2/5 Districts)
	Integration of appeals and complaints results	Data entry clerks	01-05/10/2014	LG (2/5 Districts) + LODA
	Validation process	LG and LODA	06-10/10/2014	LG (2/5 Districts)
	Data analysis	LG and LODA	10-15/10/2014	LODA and 2/5 Districts
	Report	LG,LODA and MINALOC	15/10/2014	LODA and 2/5 Districts
Awareness campaign	Meeting at village level/Umuganda	Population at Village/Umuganda	27/09/2014	Sector/Cell
	Kubaza bitera kumenya/panel show on radio & television	Population	19/10/2014	LODA/MINALOC,
	Training at National	LODA, Technical ministries, Province, Districts	21/10/2014	LODA

	Level	staff, Civil society		
	Training of trainers at District level (28 Districts)	In charge of social protection/ Ubudehe focal point person, District statistician, police, Army, NSS, Reserve force, an Opinion leader representing each sector, civil society, a JADF, representative of njyanama, Ubudehe sector focal point person / a professional for social protection, ES of sector, DASSO, VUP staff	23/10/2014	LODA
Roll out of Ubudehe categorization in 28 districts	Training of trainers at Sector level	Cell ES and SEDO of cell, police, Army, Reserve force, an Opinion leader representing each sector, civil society, JADF, representative of njyanama, Ubudehe Sector focal point person / a professional for social protection, DASSO, VUP Staff	27/10/2014	ES of sector
	Training of facilitators+ Enumerators	Village coordinators, the chairpersons of Ubudehe committees and one enumerator with good hand writing	29/10/2014	ES of Cell
	Printing forms	Forms for 28 Districts	27/09-20/10/2014	LODA and Districts
	Recruitment of Data clerks	Data clerks	27/09-20/10/2014	28 Districts
	Training of data clerks	Data entry clerks	27/09-20/10/2014	LODA & 28 Districts
	Data collection	Population	30/10-15/11/2014	LODA, Districts
	Data entry	Data entry clerks	18/11-13/12/2014	LODA, Districts
	Appeals and complaints	Population	14/12/2014- 14/1/2015	SE Sector
	Integration of approved appeals	Population	20-30/1/2015	SE Sector
	Validation process	Population	1-28/2/2015	LODA, MINALOC, LG

Data cleaning and processing	LG & LODA	1-31//3/2015	
Data Analysis	LG & LODA	1-30/4/2015	LODA
Reporting	LODA	01-31/05/2015	LODA, District

VI. Implications of the road map

The roadmap conforms to the original plan and budgeting of LODA. The current Ubudehe data is two years old, and was to run up to 2014/2015, a period of three years to align with EICV4 data, and other subsequent EICVs. EICV data provides information for comparisons and bench marking, though the two are not expected to be perfectly identical since they use different methodologies and research tools.

The implication of the road map, therefore, is that the existing data will still be valid for the fiscal year 2014/2015 Fiscal year. Targeting lists may be re-validated in case some people may have experienced shocks and/or the opposite in the course of the last two years.